

# ANNUAL REPORT ON ECRI'S ACTIVITIES

covering the period  
from 1 January to 31 December 2011



Visit our website:  
*[www.coe.int/ecri](http://www.coe.int/ecri)*

ECRI Secretariat  
Directorate General II - Democracy  
Council of Europe  
F-67075 Strasbourg Cedex  
Tel. : +33 (0)3 88 41 29 64  
Fax : +33 (0)3 88 41 39 87

Strasbourg, May 2012

|  |    |
|--|----|
| Preface -----  | 5  |
| Main trends-----   | 7  |
| ECRI's activities in 2011  |    |
| 1) Country-by-country approach -----   | 15 |
| 2) Work on general themes-----   | 17 |
| 3) Relations with civil society-----   | 18 |
| 4) Cooperation with national Specialised Bodies to<br>combat racism and racial discrimination-----       | 19 |
| 5) Other activities -----  | 19 |
| Co-operation with relevant bodies of the Council of<br>Europe and other international organisations----- | 21 |
| Appendices   |    |
| - Membership of ECRI -----   | 27 |
| - Secretariat of ECRI -----  | 35 |
| - Meetings held by ECRI in 2011 -----  | 37 |
| - List of publications -----   | 39 |

-----



# Preface

*The European Commission against Racism and Intolerance (ECRI) is a mechanism which was established by the first Summit of Heads of State and Government of the Council of Europe member States. The decision to establish ECRI is contained in the Vienna Declaration adopted by the first Summit on 9 October 1993. On 13 June 2002, the Committee of Ministers adopted an autonomous Statute for ECRI and thus consolidated its role as an independent human rights monitoring mechanism specialised in questions relating to racism and intolerance.*

*ECRI's task is to combat racism, xenophobia, antisemitism and intolerance at the level of greater Europe and from the perspective of the protection of human rights. ECRI's action covers all necessary measures to combat violence, discrimination and prejudice faced by persons or groups of persons, on grounds of "race", colour, language, religion, nationality or national or ethnic origin.*

*ECRI's members are appointed on the basis of their in-depth knowledge in the field of combating intolerance. They should have high moral authority and recognised expertise in dealing with racism, xenophobia, antisemitism and intolerance. They serve in their individual capacity, are independent and impartial in fulfilling their mandate, and do not receive any instructions from their government.*

*ECRI's statutory activities are: country-by-country monitoring; work on general themes; and relations with civil society. ECRI's strategy for constantly enhancing its activities is to take a step-by-step approach, building on the work it has already accomplished by evaluating, consolidating and extending its action.*



# Main trends

## *Introduction*

1. Each year, as an introduction to its annual report, ECRI outlines the main trends in the fields of racism<sup>1</sup>, racial discrimination<sup>2</sup>, xenophobia, antisemitism and intolerance in Europe. The purpose of this exercise is to show the context in which ECRI must continue its efforts and step up its action in the future. The precise characteristics and extent of these trends, observed in the course of ECRI's various activities, vary from region to region and country to country. They are, however, sufficiently widespread to justify a special mention.

## *The economic crisis*

2. The ongoing economic crisis has created a vicious cycle in which many of the groups of concern to ECRI (vulnerable groups) are trapped. Diminished economic opportunities and welfare cuts push them into poverty, which breeds negative feelings on both sides of the social divide. Immigrants and some historical minorities are perceived as a burden to society. Old myths about yielding influence in the financial world are revived. The "multiculturalism model" is questioned. Discrimination in employment is rife. Racism and intolerance are on the rise in Europe today and the resulting tension sometimes leads to racist violence.

---

<sup>1</sup> According to ECRI's General Policy Recommendation No.7, racism is the belief that a ground such as "race", colour, language, religion, nationality or national or ethnic origin justifies contempt for a person or a group of persons, or the notion of superiority of a person or a group of persons.

<sup>2</sup> According to ECRI's General Policy Recommendation No.7, racial discrimination is any differential treatment based on a ground such as "race", colour, language, religion, nationality or national or ethnic origin, which has no objective and reasonable justification.

.....

### ***Cuts affecting human rights institutions***

3. Efforts are made throughout Europe to make government less costly. Human rights institutions, including the national Specialised Bodies (independent organs mandated to fight racism and racial discrimination), are also affected, quite often in a disproportionate manner, at a time when they are most needed. ECRI reiterates its call upon member States to preserve the effectiveness of these bodies and to avoid undermining their capacity and, in the long run, their independence by subjecting them to radical budget cuts and staff reductions.

### ***Anti-Gypsyism***

4. High-profile incidents in several member States have again drawn attention to the worsening of the situation of Europe's Roma population, which continues to face widespread discrimination, intolerance and stigmatisation, particularly in public discourse. ECRI's dramatic country-by-country findings have prompted it to release a General Policy Recommendation (GPR No.13) on combating anti-Gypsyism and discrimination against Roma. In this text ECRI requests the authorities of all member States to adopt no less than 90 measures, including encouraging Roma victims of violence and other forms of crime – as well as police misconduct - to lodge complaints and calling on the media to avoid inflammatory reporting. According to GPR No.13, lack of access to decent housing is another major problem for Roma coupled with eviction without notice or appropriate re-housing. ECRI, accordingly, calls upon States to consider, among other steps, legalising long-tolerated Roma sites, even if they have been built in breach of town planning regulations. At the same time ECRI stresses that it is indispensable for the Roma community to contribute itself, to the extent that it can, to combating anti-Gypsyism.

### ***Rise and fall of xenophobic political parties***

5. Xenophobic discourse has been mainstreamed during the past decade, gaining increasing social acceptance. In several countries, the tone of the political debate is set by the growing



number of parties which share the same rhetoric: immigration is equated with insecurity, irregular migrants, asylum-seekers and refugees either “steal jobs” or risk “capsizing our welfare system”, while Muslims “are not able to integrate in western societies”. The latter have recently become the most prominent “other” in the xenophobic debate throughout Europe. Xenophobic parties have obtained more support in recent elections and gained seats in government coalitions and/or the parliaments of several European countries. They now have a share in political power in these countries, directly or indirectly, locally or nationally, alone or in coalitions. At the same time, in other European countries the aggressive rhetoric used by these parties to win elections has done them disservice once in office, leading to waning political influence. In ECRI’s opinion, political leaders must at all costs resist pandering to prejudice and misplaced fears about the loss of “European values”, terrorism and common criminality. ECRI joins other voices in Europe calling upon member States for a strategy for the democratic management of diversity in our continent.

6. Despite this worrying trend, in a few countries persons with a migration background have obtained a large degree of recognition of their rights thanks to their political and social mobilisation, winning legal battles and the support of an important part of the majority population.

### ***Migrants and asylum seekers***

7. Some European countries failed on several accounts in their reaction to the sudden influx of migrants in 2011 – resulting inter alia from the events in North Africa. The problems witnessed included excessively rapid returns of some arrivals and poor reception conditions. The latter have created serious tension with the local population, while some countries’ asylum requests’ processing systems have broken down completely. The culture of “policing”, which seems to have prevailed in the management of this migration influx, has also produced a crisis in the relations between Schengen States; the resulting discussions around the reintroduction of internal border controls have added further fuel to the xenophobic debate.

8. ECRI deeply regrets the fact that some member States - often using their anti-terrorism legislation - have removed or tried to remove from their territory non-citizens who had obtained interim protection by the European Court of Human Rights.

### ***Nationwide censuses and collection of equality data***

9. In the course of its country-by-country monitoring and in its General Policy Recommendations, ECRI has always stressed the need to follow closely manifestations of racial discrimination in a number of key social fields. This is why ECRI has regularly called on governments to collect equality data, i.e. statistics broken down by citizenship, national/ethnic origin, language and religion. During 2011 a number of Council of Europe member States launched nation-wide censuses which in some cases included non-mandatory questions on ethnic, linguistic and religious affiliation. ECRI hopes that after this round of censuses, it will be possible to focus on the situation of vulnerable groups about which little information is otherwise available and to understand better the context in which racial discrimination occurs. This will also help to assess the effectiveness of policies targeting these groups, so as to be able to make necessary changes and adjustments.

### ***Internet, extremism and racist violence***

10. Advocacy of national, racial or religious hatred that constitutes incitement to discrimination, hostility or violence continues to be a major problem in Europe today. Social media have recently proven singularly effective in encouraging radicalisation. Websites focusing exclusively on Muslim immigration in Europe and allegations about a worldwide Jewish conspiracy amplify the risk of extremism. This is partly the result of virtual communities' refusing to talk to each other, as various Internet fora often attract like-minded people who encourage/reinforce each other's prejudices. ECRI has dedicated serious attention to this issue proposing a number of practical measures in its General Policy Recommendation No.6 on Combating the Dissemination of Racist, Xenophobic and Antisemitic Material via the Internet. However, ECRI is aware

---

that countering these phenomena without undermining freedom of expression is not an easy task. While trying to meet these Internet-specific challenges, governments are also encouraged to address the problem of hate speech in general, including the responsibility of the media and politicians.

11. ECRI has always drawn attention to the specific dangers created by a climate of opinion propitious to racism and racial discrimination. Tragic events (which have either occurred or been brought to the fore recently) have shown the danger of complacency vis-à-vis some forms of extremism and have amply demonstrated how the cumulative effect of various forms of hate speech can lead to extreme forms of racist violence. At the same time, ECRI country reports continue to highlight instances of small-scale but persistent attacks targeting historical minorities, such as the desecration of cemeteries and widespread racist graffiti. ECRI has invited authorities not to neglect these phenomena and to react promptly, in order, inter alia, to avoid escalation.

### ***Racism in sport***

12. Also in 2011 a number of racist incidents have been recorded in football stadiums in many countries. In addition to imposing criminal penalties where appropriate, ECRI recommends authorities to pursue and intensify their efforts to combat racism in sport with preventive measures in accordance with its General Policy Recommendation No.12.

### ***Religious discrimination and intolerance***

13. ECRI notes that tensions continue to exist between religious communities, between members of some religious groups and members of other minorities, as well as between certain States and certain religious groups. ECRI is of the opinion that the authorities must protect everyone from religious discrimination and intolerance, while remaining strictly impartial in their relations with the various communities involved. They must also recognise that, in some cases, religion is used as a pretext to cover for discrimination on other grounds. At the same time,

---

ECRI is pleased to note that religion and religious organisations, including of course those of the majority, play a positive role in promoting a culture of "living together" based on pluralism and dialogue.

### ***Multiple discrimination and its gender dimension***

14. ECRI quite often deals with cases of multiple discrimination, in which persons are denied rights or opportunities on several grounds. Muslim women are, for example, subject to prejudice not only because of their religion but also because of their gender and, quite often, their migration background. Many of their difficulties in finding employment or housing are linked to their choice to wear a headscarf. ECRI has noted that multiple discrimination is rarely monitored. It has, therefore, invited national authorities to set up systems of data collection which would also take account of the gender dimension of racial discrimination.

### ***Need for positive messages supported by facts***

15. In ECRI's view, it is a mistake to consider that the fight against racism and intolerance is only of interest to vulnerable groups. A fairer society is of benefit to all. More has to be done to project a positive image of a diverse society and to explain better the advantages stemming therefrom. For example, eliminating racial discrimination in employment can result in the creation of a diverse workforce offering employers an unlimited pool of talent, which is at the basis of any successful business. Countering the widespread negative stereotypes of vulnerable groups with positive messages based on facts is the strategy to follow, in particular emphasising the multifaceted contribution they have made to the cultural richness and economic well-being of European societies. Diversity in Europe derives from its history: vigilance and resistance to racist, xenophobic, antisemitic and intolerant phenomena are essential for the preservation of its sustainable future.

## ***The European Convention on Human Rights***

16. ECRI is disappointed to note that Protocol No.12, which supplements the European Convention on Human Rights by prohibiting discrimination in general, has only been ratified by 18 of the 47 member States of the Council of Europe; regrettably no country deposited a ratification instrument in 2011. ECRI will continue to recommend ratification of Protocol No.12 in the course of its country-by-country monitoring.

17. ECRI is pleased to note that its standards and country-by-country findings continue to be referred to by the European Court of Human Rights in its judgements. In 2011 the Court cited ECRI's work in the following judgements: Soare and others v. Romania and V.C. v. Slovakia.



# ECRI's activities in 2011

## 1. Country-by-country approach

1. ECRI's statutory activities comprise firstly country-by-country monitoring work. ECRI closely examines the situation in each of the member States of the Council of Europe and draws up suggestions and proposals as to how the problems it has identified might be overcome. The aim is to formulate helpful and well-founded recommendations, which may assist governments in taking concrete and practical steps to counter racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia, antisemitism and intolerance.

2. ECRI's reports are first sent in draft form to the member States concerned for confidential dialogue. Their contents are reviewed in the light of the national authorities' comments. They are then finally adopted and transmitted to the governments of the member States concerned, through the intermediary of the Council of Europe's Committee of Ministers.

3. ECRI's country-by-country approach concerns all Council of Europe member States on an equal footing. The reports for the first cycle were completed in late 1998. From January 1999 to the end of December 2002, ECRI worked on the second round of its country-by-country approach. From January 2003 to the end of December 2007, ECRI worked on the third round of its country-by-country approach.

4. At the beginning of 2008, ECRI started a new monitoring cycle (2008-2012). The fourth-round reports focus on the implementation of the principal recommendations addressed to governments in the third round. They examine whether and how these have been followed up by the authorities. They evaluate how effective government policies are and analyse new developments. Confidential dialogue has been strengthened for the fourth monitoring cycle.

5. In addition, a new interim follow-up mechanism has been introduced: ECRI requests priority implementation for up to three recommendations and asks the member State concerned to provide information in this connection within two years from

publication of the report. Through the new interim follow-up procedure, ECRI seeks to assist Council of Europe member States in fine-tuning their response to the recommendations made in its country reports. At its plenary session of December 2011, ECRI adopted its conclusions on the implementation of the priority recommendations it had made in its reports on Bulgaria, Hungary and Norway (published in February 2009).

6. In order to obtain as full a picture as possible, a contact visit is organised before the drafting of each new report. The visits provide an opportunity for ECRI Rapporteurs to meet officials from the various ministries and public authorities dealing with issues within ECRI's remit. They also give Rapporteurs the opportunity to meet representatives of NGOs working in the field, as well as independent experts and other persons concerned by the fight against racism and intolerance.

7. In 2011 ECRI published nine reports of the fourth monitoring cycle. The reports on Armenia, Bosnia and Herzegovina, Monaco, Spain and Turkey were published on 8 February, the reports on Azerbaijan, Cyprus and Serbia on 31 May and the report on Lithuania on 13 September.

8. The publication and effective dissemination of ECRI's country-by-country reports is an important stage in the ongoing, active dialogue between ECRI and the member States' authorities. The common aim is that recommendations should be as constructive and useful as possible. More regular contacts, through the new interim follow-up procedure, will assist countries in fine-tuning their response.

9. All reports published in 2011 have been translated into the national language(s) of the country concerned and steps have been taken to ensure that they are circulated as widely as possible among stakeholders at domestic level.

10. ECRI's reports received considerable media coverage. A press release is issued and widely distributed whenever a report is published. It serves as a basis for articles in the press and broadcasts. In 2011 ECRI's reports and other related activities received increased media coverage (see paragraph 22).



11. In 2011 ECRI carried out nine contact visits in Andorra, Croatia, Denmark, Iceland, Latvia, Luxembourg, Montenegro, Sweden and Ukraine.

12. To be able to maintain this rhythm of visits (concluding the fourth cycle as planned in 2012) and the quality of the work which is expected of it under its Statute, ECRI needs a Secretariat with sufficient resources and expertise.

13. ECRI, in order to prepare its fifth monitoring cycle, set up a Working Group on Methods, which held four meetings in 2011. The Working Group reported to the plenary during the latter's December session.

## **2. Work on general themes**

### *General Policy Recommendations*

14. ECRI's General Policy Recommendations, the second part of its statutory activities, are addressed to the governments of all member States; they cover important areas of current concern in the fight against racism and intolerance. They are intended to serve as guidelines for policy-makers when drawing up national strategies, programmes and projects.

15. As already mentioned, on 19 September ECRI published a new General Policy Recommendation (GPR No.13) on combating anti-Gypsyism and discrimination against Roma. The recommendation is available also in the Romani language. A number of events were organised to launch the Recommendation including a press conference on 19 September at the Council of Europe's Brussels Office, a presentation during the Summit of Mayors on Roma in Strasbourg on 22 September and a side event during the OSCE Human Dimension Implementation Meeting in Warsaw on 4 October.

16. ECRI made good progress towards the adoption of GPR No.14 dealing with racism and racial discrimination in employment, which is expected to be published in the second semester of 2012.

### 3. Relations with civil society

17. Combating racism and intolerance can only be effective if the message filters down to society in general. Awareness-raising and a communication strategy are, therefore, essential. ECRI attaches great importance to this third part of its statutory activities.

#### *ECRI's contribution to international NGOs' meetings*

18. ECRI members participated in and contributed to events organised by international NGOs, including an international conference on hate crime held in Berlin on 23- 24 November.

#### *Organisation of national round tables in member States*

19. As an important tool to facilitate dialogue between state and non-state actors on issues related to the fight against racism and intolerance, ECRI organises national round tables following the publication of its country-specific monitoring reports. These events are addressed to various actors in civil society as well as to government officials in order to discuss jointly how best to promote the implementation of ECRI's recommendations.

20. Three round tables were organised in 2011: in France, Georgia and Serbia. The first was held in Paris on 26 April on the French Senate's premises; it was organised jointly with the Human Rights Consultative National Commission (*Commission nationale consultative des droits de l'homme*, CNCDH) and the High Authority against Discrimination and for Equality (*Haute autorité de lutte contre les discriminations et pour l'égalité de chances*, HALDE). The second was held in Tbilisi on 12 October; it was organised in co-operation with the Public Defender (Ombudsman). The third was held in Belgrade on 16 November; it was organised in co-operation with the Protector of Citizens (Ombudsman) and the Commissioner for the Protection of Equality.

### *Communication strategy*

21. In 2011 ECRI continued improving its communication strategy. ECRI's three above-mentioned round tables attracted high attention. International media reported extensively on GPR No.13 on combating anti-Gypsyism and discrimination against Roma, which was launched at a press conference in Brussels on 19 September.

22. In 2011 ECRI's Secretariat identified 313 newspaper and Web articles concerning ECRI and the results of its activities. The Secretariat prepared "visibility reviews" providing an account of these articles and of 22 interviews given by ECRI representatives.

## **4. Cooperation with national Specialised Bodies to combat racism and racial discrimination**

23. National Specialised Bodies are strategic partners for ECRI. A seminar of national Specialised Bodies, focusing on racism and racial discrimination in employment, was held from 26 to 27 May in Strasbourg. The seminar's participants, representing almost all member States' national Specialised Bodies, as well as a number of specialised NGOs and National Ombudsmen, provided in depth information on the legal framework and practice for combating this phenomenon.

## **5. Other activities**

24. At its 56th plenary session on 6-9 December, ECRI held elections to the posts of Chair, two Vice-Chairs and three Bureau members. Mr Nils Muiznieks (member in respect of Latvia) was elected Chair for two years; Mr Francois Sant'Angelo (member in respect of Belgium) was elected 1st Vice-Chair for one year and Mr Christian Ahlund (member in respect of Sweden) was elected 2nd Vice-Chair for the same term. Ms Barbara John (member in respect of Germany), Mr Marc Leyenberger (member in respect of France) and Mr Jean-Charles Sacotte (member in respect of Monaco) were elected members of the Bureau for two years. They assumed their functions on 1 January 2012.



# Co-operation with relevant bodies of the Council of Europe and other international organisations

## Council of Europe

1. ECRI is regularly updated on the work of other Council of Europe bodies dealing with issues related to racism and intolerance. ECRI's Secretariat provides these bodies with information on ECRI's activities.

2. In the process of the organisational reform of the Council of Europe, in 2011 an Antidiscrimination Standards and Policies Department covering the Secretariats of ECRI, the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities (FCNM) and the European Charter for Regional or Minority Language (ECRML) was created. The creation of the Department will lead to strengthening the cooperation between the three monitoring bodies' secretariats. The Bureau of ECRI and the Bureau of the Advisory Committee on the FCNM participated in a joint meeting in Paris on 13 May to discuss working methods, develop increased synergy between their monitoring mechanisms and reinforce the impact of each other's activities. The Chair of ECRI also took part in the meeting of presidents of monitoring mechanisms which was organised in Strasbourg on 19 December.

3. The Parliamentary Assembly (PACE) and the Congress of Local and Regional Authorities of the Council of Europe (the Congress) are represented at ECRI's plenary meetings and contribute to its work. Similarly, ECRI contributes to the work and events organised by PACE and the Congress, such as two PACE committee hearings on Muslim women and on Children of undocumented migrants held on 4 October and 8 December, as well as the Summit of Mayors on Roma held in Strasbourg on 22-23 September. ECRI contributed with comments to the Opinion of the Commissioner for Human Rights on effective and independent structures for promoting equality, which was published in March. On 21 March on the occasion of the launching of a handbook on European non-discrimination law, ECRI contributed to a seminar at the European Court of Human

Rights, which was organised jointly by the Court and the EU Fundamental Rights Agency (FRA).

4. On the occasion of the Turkish Chairmanship of the Committee of Ministers, ECRI organised, jointly with the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Republic of Turkey, a seminar on Fighting discrimination based on racial, ethnic, religious or other bias, which took place in Ankara on 10-11 January.

5. ECRI's Chair attended a conference on The Prevention of Human Rights Violations organised by the Council of Europe in co-operation with the Ministry of Justice of Ukraine on 20-21 September in Kyiv. Furthermore, two ECRI members participated in and contributed to a conference on The role of National Human Rights Structures in Protecting against all Forms of Discrimination organised in Sarajevo on 28-29 September. ECRI contributed to a conference on Combating Hate Speech in South-Eastern Europe held in Sarajevo on 17-18 November. On 28-29 November an ECRI member participated in the Council of Europe Exchange on the religious dimension of intercultural dialogue that took place in Luxembourg.

## **United Nations**

### *Universal Periodic Review*

6. In 2011 ECRI contributed to the 12th and 13th Universal Periodical Review with eight country reports.

### *UN Conventions*

7. ECRI reports make regular reference to the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (ICERD) and other relevant United Nations treaties such as the International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families, reinforcing their monitoring bodies' findings or calling for their ratification. ECRI also calls upon States that have not yet made a declaration under Article 14 of ICERD, enabling individuals and groups of individuals to file petitions before the UN Committee for the Elimination of Racial Discrimination (CERD), to do so.

8. On 18 February 2011 the Chair of ECRI attended the plenary meeting of CERD for an exchange of views on enhancing cooperation between the two mechanisms. CERD members presented their committee's Concluding Observations concerning France and Serbia at the national round tables organised by ECRI in April in Paris and in November in Belgrade on the occasion of the publication of its reports on the two countries.

*Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights (OHCHR)*

9. ECRI is regularly invited to participate in various meetings organised by the OHCHR and to submit contributions based on its monitoring and thematic work. For example a representative of ECRI addressed the regional OHCHR expert workshop on The Prohibition of Incitement to National, Racial or Religious Hatred held in Vienna on 9-10 February. ECRI contributed with a keynote speech to an OHCHR workshop in Saint Petersburg, entitled Towards a Coherent National Policy to Prevent and Combat Racial Discrimination and Related Intolerance: Developing and Implementing National Action Plans. This was an event for the benefit of CIS countries co-organised with the Saint Petersburg Regional Branch of the Russian Red Cross on 29-30 September.

10. Similarly the OHCHR is invited to meetings organised by ECRI. For example, the OHCHR was represented at the seminar organised by ECRI and the Turkish Chairmanship of the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe in Ankara in January (see paragraph 4). The Chief of the Anti-Discrimination Section of the OHCHR participated in the seminar organised by ECRI with national Specialised Bodies on racism and racial discrimination in employment in Strasbourg in May 2011 (see ECRI's activities in 2011, paragraph 23).

*Special Procedures*

11. On 7 December, the UN Special Rapporteur on freedom of religion or belief addressed ECRI's plenary meeting in Strasbourg.

*United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR)*

12. ECRI has a close working relationship with UNHCR, facilitated by the UNHCR Representation to the European Institutions in Strasbourg. ECRI receives regularly input from UNHCR concerning its country visits, round tables and various legal issues (for example, whether national legislation on asylum/international protection which considers “the threat to national security and public order” as a ground for refusing refugee status would be at variance with the 1951 Convention Relating to the Status of Refugees).

**Organisation for Security and Co-operation in Europe (OSCE)**

13. ECRI and OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights (ODIHR) continued to involve each other in their conferences and meetings. OSCE/ODIHR is systematically invited to and attends ECRI’s national round tables, such as the ones held in Tbilisi on 12 October and in Belgrade on 16 November.

14. ECRI participated in the OSCE Human Dimension Committee meeting on hate crimes held in Vienna on 6 September. ECRI also participated in and moderated a session of the OSCE conference on Preventing and Responding to Hate Incidents and Crimes against Christians held in Rome on 12 September. ECRI took part in the OSCE Human Dimension Implementation Meeting (HDIM) held in Warsaw on 26 September - 7 October where it organised a side event to present its GPR No. 13. Furthermore ECRI took part in a side event on combating extremism against Roma and Sinti.

15. Both ODIHR and ECRI continue to attach particular importance to the fight against hate crime. The two bodies cooperate and benefit from each other’s expertise and initiatives in this area: ECRI’s country-by-country reports and General Policy Recommendations and ODIHR’s compilation of data entitled Hate Crimes in the OSCE Region – Incidents and Responses: Annual Report 2010.



## **European Union**

### *European Commission*

16. The Directorate of Equality of the Directorate General - Justice of the European Commission and ECRI's Secretariat keep each other informed of important developments in their work and exchange information on subjects of common interest. A representative of the European Commission participated in the seminar organised by ECRI and the Turkish Chairmanship of the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe in Ankara in January (see paragraph 4). Furthermore, a representative of the European Commission took part in a meeting of ECRI's Working Group on discrimination in employment in Brussels on 6-7 October.

### *Fundamental Rights Agency (FRA)*

17. Cooperation between ECRI and FRA continued in 2011. ECRI reports make regular reference to FRA's work. Co-operation included also exchange of information and participation in events. In particular, ECRI attended a meeting with FRA at its headquarters in Vienna on 17 January to explore possibilities of cooperation between, on the one hand, FRA, and on the other, the monitoring bodies of the Council of Europe and the Special Representative of the Secretary General for Roma issues. On 21 March, FRA's Director addressed ECRI's plenary meeting in Strasbourg.

### **Joint ECRI/ODIHR/FRA Statement**

18. In order to give greater visibility to and strengthen their message, ECRI, ODIHR and FRA made a joint statement on the occasion of the International Day for the Elimination of Racial Discrimination on 21 March. ODIHR's Director, FRA's Director and ECRI's Chair strongly condemned manifestations of racism and related intolerance, with a particular focus on the situation of Roma. They called upon the authorities to remove barriers to education, health care, housing and employment for Roma and to support initiatives for their reintegration and awareness campaigns to challenge stereotypes and prejudice.

## **Other**

19. In 2011 ECRI intensified its co-operation with the European Network of Equality Bodies (EQUINET). The Executive Director of EQUINET participated in the Specialised Bodies seminar (see ECRI's activities in 2011, paragraph 23). Likewise, an ECRI representative attended the EQUINET high-level meeting on Realising the Potential of Equality Bodies held in Brussels on 29 November.

20. ECRI's Chair contributed as keynote speaker to the General Conference of the European Coalition of Cities Against Racism (ECCAR) which took place in Ghent on 24-25 November. The conference on Building Partnerships – Making a Difference focused on the question of how local authorities can co-operate with discriminated groups.

# Appendix I<sup>3</sup>

## ECRI's membership

| <b>Name</b>           | <b>Member in respect of</b>                 | <b>Term of office expires</b> |
|-----------------------|---|-------------------------------|
| Mr Christian ÅHLUND   | Sweden                                      | 25 May 2015                   |
| Mr Levan ALEXIDZE     | Georgia                                     | 1 January 2013                |
| Ms Elena ANDREEVSKA   | “the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia” | 6 February 2013               |
| Ms Raluca BESTELIU    | Romania                                     | 1 January 2013                |
| Mr Abdel Hamid BEYUKI | Spain                                       | 1 January 2013                |
| Mr Sinisa BJEKOVIC    | Montenegro                                  | 10 December 2013              |
| Mr Thomas BÜCHEL      | Liechtenstein                               | 19 May 2014                   |
| Mr Tonio ELLUL        | Malta                                       | 18 November 2014              |
| Mr Vitaliano ESPOSITO | Italy                                       | 1 January 2013                |
| Mr Michael FARRELL    | Ireland                                     | 23 November 2016              |

---

<sup>3</sup> All tables in this appendix reflect the situation on 31 December 2011.

| <b>Name</b>                | <b>Member in respect of</b> | <b>Term of office expires</b> |
|----------------------------|-----------------------------|-------------------------------|
| Mr Gilberto FELICI         | San Marino                  | 12 June 2013                  |
| Mr Fernando FERREIRA RAMOS | Portugal                    | 1 January 2013                |
| Mr Ivan GARVALOV           | Bulgaria                    | 1 January 2013                |
| Mr Lauri HANNIKAINEN       | Finland                     | 1 January 2013                |
| Mr Michael HEAD            | United Kingdom              | 1 January 2013                |
| Ms Gudrun HOLGERSEN        | Norway                      | 1 January 2013                |
| Ms Vasilika HYSI           | Albania                     | 1 January 2013                |
| Mr Rovshan ISMAYILOV       | Azerbaijan                  | 1 January 2013                |
| Mr Dalibor JÍLEK           | Czech Republic              | 1 January 2013                |
| Ms Barbara JOHN            | Germany                     | 1 January 2013                |
| Mr Jenő KALTENBACH         | Hungary                     | 1 January 2013                |
| Mr Vigen KOCHARYAN         | Armenia                     | 1 January 2013                |
| Mr Baldur KRISTJÁNSSON     | Iceland                     | 1 January 2013                |

| <b>Name</b>                      | <b>Member in respect of</b> | <b>Term of office expires</b> |
|----------------------------------|-----------------------------|-------------------------------|
| Mr Gün KUT                       | Turkey                      | 1 January 2013                |
| Mr Jean-Paul LEHNERS             | Luxembourg                  | 9 February 2016               |
| Mr Marc LEYENBERGER              | France                      | 22 April 2014                 |
| Mr Petro MARTINENKO              | Ukraine                     | 1 July 2014                   |
| Mr Arvydas Virgilijus MATULIONIS | Lithuania                   | 1 January 2013                |
| Mr Krzysztof MOTYKA              | Poland                      | 2 May 2012                    |
| Mr Nils MUIZNIEKS                | Latvia                      | 20 April 2015                 |
| Mr Mart NUTT                     | Estonia                     | 1 January 2013                |
| Mr Dejan PALIĆ                   | Croatia                     | 1 July 2014                   |
| Mr Andreas PASCHALIDES           | Cyprus                      | 1 January 2013                |
| Mr Stelios E. PERRAKIS           | Greece                      | 1 January 2013                |
| Mr Tibor PICHLER                 | Slovakia                    | 1 January 2013                |
| Ms Alenka PUHAR                  | Slovenia                    | 1 January 2013                |

| <b>Name</b>                  | <b>Member in respect of</b> | <b>Term of office expires</b> |
|------------------------------|-----------------------------|-------------------------------|
| Ms Vesna RAKIC-VODINELIC     | Serbia                      | 7 November 2012               |
| Mr Jacint RIBERAYGUA CAELLES | Andorra                     | 27 September 2016             |
| Mr Jean-Charles SACOTTE      | Monaco                      | 7 December 2015               |
| Mr François SANT'ANGELO      | Belgium                     | 1 January 2013                |
| Mr Gerald SCHÖPFER           | Austria                     | 1 March 2015                  |
| Ms Eva SMITH ASMUSSEN        | Denmark                     | 1 January 2013                |
| Ms Winnie SORGDRAGER         | Netherlands                 | 1 January 2013                |
| Mr Felix STANEVSKIY          | Russian Federation          | 1 January 2013                |
| Mr Daniel THÜRER             | Switzerland                 | 1 January 2014                |
| Mr Victor VOLCINSCHI         | Moldova                     | 18 September 2013             |
| Vacant seat                  | Bosnia and Herzegovina      |                               |

## Deputies to ECRI members

| <b>Name</b>                | <b>Deputy in respect of</b> | <b>Term of office expires</b> |
|----------------------------|-----------------------------|-------------------------------|
| Mr Pedro AGUILERA CORTES   | Spain                       | 1 January 2013                |
| Ms Doris ANGST             | Switzerland                 | 1 January 2014                |
| Ms Cecilia CARDOGNA        | San Marino                  | 12 June 2013                  |
| Mr Patrick CHARLIER        | Belgium                     | 1 January 2013                |
| Mr Régis DE GOUTTES        | France                      | 22 April 2014                 |
| Mr Saša GAJIN              | Serbia                      | 7 November 2012               |
| Ms Carolina HADJIATHANSIOU | Cyprus                      | 1 January 2013                |
| Ms Ketevan KHUTSISHVILI    | Georgia                     | 1 January 2013                |
| Mr Paul Aarre LAPPALAINEN  | Sweden                      | 25 May 2015                   |
| Mr Šarūnas LIEKIS          | Lithuania                   | 1 January 2013                |
| Mr Alexis MARQUET          | Monaco                      | 7 December 2015               |
| Mr Antonio MURA            | Italy                       | 1 January 2013                |
| Ms Merja PENTIKÄINEN       | Finland                     | 1 January 2013                |

## **Observers to ECRI**

### ***Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe***

Mr Boriss CILEVICS

Ms Kerstin LUNDGREN

Mr André SCHNEIDER

### ***Holy See***

Mr Jean-Pierre MACHELON

### ***European Commission***

Ms Pia LINDHOLM



## **ECRI's Bureau**

Mr Nils MUIZNIEKS  
Chair  
member in respect of Latvia

Mr Christian ÅHLUND  
Vice-Chair  
member in respect of Sweden

Ms Vasilika HYSI  
Vice-Chair  
member in respect of Albania

Mr Lauri HANNIKAINEN  
Bureau member  
member in respect of Finland

Mr Jean-Charles SACOTTE  
Bureau member  
member in respect of Monaco

Mr François SANT'ANGELO  
Vice-Chair  
member in respect of Belgium

Ms Eva SMITH ASMUSSEN  
Bureau member  
member in respect of Denmark



# Appendix II<sup>4</sup>

## ECRI's Secretariat

**Mr Stephanos STAVROS**, Executive Secretary to ECRI  
Tel: +33 (0) 3 88 41 30 62

**Mr Stefano VALENTI**, External Relations Officer  
Tel: +33 (0) 3 90 21 43 28

**Ms Sarah BURTON**, Lawyer  
Tel: + 33 (0) 3 90 21 53 72

**Ms Aline USANASE**, Lawyer  
Tel: +33 (0) 3 88 41 23 17

**Ms Camilla TESSENYI**, Lawyer  
Tel: + 33 (0) 3 88 41 30 29

**Ms Francesca MONTAGNA**, Lawyer  
Tel: + 33 (0) 3 88 41 33 25

**Mr Lubomir MAJERCIK**, Junior External Relations Officer  
Tel.: +33 (0) 3 90 21 56 71

**Ms Paula ECK-WALTERS**, Documentalist  
Tel: +33 (0) 3 88 41 33 99

**Ms Sylvia LEHMANN**, Assistant  
Tel: +33 (0) 3 88 41 29 64

**Ms Irida VARFI-BOEHRER**, Assistant  
Tel: +33 (0) 3 88 41 31 57

**Ms Clémentine TROLONG-BAILLY**, Assistant  
Tel: +33 (0) 3 88 41 21 22

---

<sup>4</sup> This appendix reflects the situation on 31 December 2011.

.....

**Secretariat's address**

Directorate General II - Democracy  
Directorate of Human Rights and Antidiscrimination  
Council of Europe  
67075 STRASBOURG CEDEX  
France

**E-mail Secretariat:** [ecri@coe.int](mailto:ecri@coe.int)

**Fax Secretariat:** +33 (0) 3 88 41 39 87

# Appendix III

## Meetings held by ECRI in 2011

### Plenary sessions

- 23-25 March 2011
- 21-24 June 2011
- 6-9 December 2011

### Meetings of CBC Working Groups

- CBC 1: 5 December 2011
- CBC 2: 20 June 2011
- CBC 3: 15 July 2011
- CBC 4: 14 January 2011
- CBC 5: 14 September 2011 and 9 December 2011
- CBC 7: 20 June 2011
- CBC 8: 20 January 2011 and 9 December 2011
- CBC 9: 13 July 2011 and 9 December 2011

### National round tables

- France: 26 April 2011
- Georgia: 12 October 2011
- Serbia: 16 November 2011

### Seminar with national Specialised Bodies to combat racism and racial discrimination “Racism and racial discrimination in employment”

- 26-27 May 2011

### Bureau meetings

- 22 March 2011
- 20 June 2011
- 5 December 2011

### Meetings of the Working Group on relations with civil society

- 22 March 2011
- 20 June 2011
- 5 December 2011

### Meetings of the Working Group on racial discrimination in employment

- 27 May 2011
- 6-7 October 2011

### Meeting of the Working Group on anti-Gypsyism

- 27 January 2011

### Meetings of the Working Group on methods

- 12 September 2011
- 21 October 2011
- 18 November 2011
- 5 December 2011

## **Contact Visits**

- Montenegro: 6-10 February 2011
- Luxembourg: 7-11 March 2011
- Iceland: 3-7 April 2011
- Ukraine: 4-8 April 2011
- Latvia: 4-9 April 2011
- Sweden: 4-9 September 2011
- Andorra: 14-16 September 2011
- Denmark: 19-23 September 2011
- Croatia: 7-11 November 2011

# Appendix IV

## List of publications<sup>5</sup>

- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.1: Combating racism, xenophobia antisemitism and intolerance (Strasbourg, 4 October 1996)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.2: Specialised bodies to combat racism, xenophobia, antisemitism and intolerance at national level (Strasbourg, 13 June 1997)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.3: combating racism and intolerance against Roma/Gypsies (Strasbourg, 6 March 1998)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.4: National surveys on the experience and perception of discrimination and racism from the point of view of potential victims (Strasbourg, 6 March 1998)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.5: Combating intolerance and discrimination against Muslims (Strasbourg, 27 April 2000)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.6: Combating the dissemination of racist, xenophobic and antisemitic material via the Internet (Strasbourg, 15 December 2000)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.7: National legislation to combat racism and racial discrimination (Strasbourg, 13 December 2002)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.8: Combating racism while fighting terrorism (Strasbourg, 8 June 2004)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.9: The fight against antisemitism (Strasbourg, 9 September 2004)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.10: Combating racism and racial discrimination in and through school education (Strasbourg, 21 March 2007)

---

<sup>5</sup> Publications that are out of date no longer figure on this list.

.....

- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.11: Combating racism and racial discrimination in policing (Strasbourg, 4 October 2007)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.12: Combating racism and racial discrimination in the field of sport (Strasbourg, 19 March 2009)
- ECRI General Policy Recommendation No.13: Combating anti-Gypsyism and discrimination against Roma (Strasbourg, 19 September 2011)
- ECRI's country-by-country approach:

→ First round:

- Volume I (Strasbourg, September 1997)
- Volume II (Strasbourg, March 1998)
- Volume III (Strasbourg, 15 June 1998)
- Volume IV (Strasbourg, 26 January 1999)
- Volume V (Strasbourg, 13 March 1999)
- Volume VI (Strasbourg, 24 May 1999)
- Volume VII (Strasbourg, 9 November 1999)

→ Second round:

- Albania (Strasbourg, 3 April 2001)
- Andorra (Strasbourg, 15 April 2003)
- Armenia (Strasbourg, 8 July 2003)
- Austria (Strasbourg, 3 April 2001)
- Azerbaijan (Strasbourg, 15 April 2003)
- Belgium (Strasbourg, 21 March 2000)
- Bulgaria (Strasbourg, 21 March 2000)
- Croatia (Strasbourg, 3 July 2001)
- Cyprus (Strasbourg, 3 July 2001)
- Czech Republic (Strasbourg, 21 March 2000)
- Denmark (Strasbourg, 3 March 2001)
- Estonia (Strasbourg, 23 April 2002)
- Finland (Strasbourg, 23 July 2002)
- France (Strasbourg, 27 June 2000)
- Georgia (Strasbourg, 23 April 2002)
- Germany (Strasbourg, 3 July 2001)



- Greece (Strasbourg, 27 June 2000)
- Hungary (Strasbourg, 21 March 2000)
- Iceland (Strasbourg, 8 July 2003)
- Ireland (Strasbourg, 23 April 2002)
- Italy (Strasbourg, 23 April 2002)
- Latvia (Strasbourg, 23 July 2002)
- Liechtenstein (Strasbourg, 15 April 2003)
- Lithuania (Strasbourg, 15 April 2003)
- Luxembourg (Strasbourg, 8 July 2003)
- Malta (Strasbourg, 23 July 2002)
- Moldova (Strasbourg, 15 April 2003)
- The Netherlands (Strasbourg, 13 November 2001)
- Norway (Strasbourg, 27 June 2000)
- Poland (Strasbourg, 27 June 2000)
- Portugal (Strasbourg, 4 November 2002)
- Romania (Strasbourg, 23 April 2002)
- Russian Federation (Strasbourg, 13 November 2001)
- San Marino (Strasbourg, 4 November 2003)
- Slovakia (Strasbourg, 27 June 2000)
- Slovenia (Strasbourg, 8 July 2003)
- Spain (Strasbourg, 8 July 2003)
- Sweden (Strasbourg, 15 April 2003)
- Switzerland (Strasbourg, 21 March 2000)
- “the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia”  
(Strasbourg, 3 April 2001)
- Turkey (Strasbourg, 3 July 2001)
- Ukraine (Strasbourg, 23 July 2002)
- United Kingdom (Strasbourg, 3 April 2001)
- Compilation of second round reports  
(Strasbourg, February 2004)

→ Third round:

- Albania (Strasbourg, 14 June 2005)
- Andorra (Strasbourg, 12 February 2008)
- Armenia (Strasbourg, 13 February 2007)
- Austria (Strasbourg, 15 February 2005)
- Azerbaijan (Strasbourg, 24 May 2007)
- Belgium (Strasbourg, 27 January 2004)
- Bosnia and Herzegovina (Strasbourg, 15 February 2005)

- Bulgaria (Strasbourg, 27 January 2004)
- Croatia (Strasbourg, 14 June 2005)
- Cyprus (Strasbourg, 16 May 2006)
- Czech Republic (Strasbourg, 8 June 2004)
- Denmark (Strasbourg, 16 May 2006)
- Estonia (Strasbourg, 21 February 2006)
- Finland (Strasbourg, 24 May 2007)
- France (Strasbourg, 15 February 2005)
- Georgia (Strasbourg, 13 February 2007)
- Germany (Strasbourg, 8 June 2004)
- Greece (Strasbourg, 8 June 2004)
- Hungary (Strasbourg, 8 June 2004)
- Iceland (Strasbourg, 13 February 2007)
- Ireland (Strasbourg, 24 May 2007)
- Italy (Strasbourg, 16 May 2006)
- Latvia (Strasbourg, 12 February 2008)
- Liechtenstein (Strasbourg, 29 April 2008)
- Lithuania (Strasbourg, 21 February 2006)
- Luxembourg (Strasbourg, 16 May 2006)
- Malta (Strasbourg, 29 April 2008)
- Moldova (Strasbourg, 29 April 2008)
- Monaco (Strasbourg, 24 May 2007)
- Netherland (Strasbourg, 12 February 2008)
- Norway (Strasbourg, 27 January 2004)
- Poland (Strasbourg, 14 June 2005)
- Portugal (Strasbourg, 13 February 2007)
- Romania (Strasbourg, 21 February 2006)
- Russian Federation (Strasbourg, 16 May 2006)
- San Marino (Strasbourg, 29 April 2008)
- Serbia (Strasbourg, 29 April 2008)
- Slovakia (Strasbourg, 27 January 2004)
- Slovenia (Strasbourg, 13 February 2007)
- Spain (Strasbourg, 21 February 2006)
- Sweden (Strasbourg, 14 June 2005)
- Switzerland (Strasbourg, 27 January 2004)
- "the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia"  
(Strasbourg, 15 February 2005)
- Turkey (Strasbourg, 15 February 2005)
- Ukraine (Strasbourg, 12 February 2008)
- United Kingdom (Strasbourg, 14 June 2005)

→ Fourth round:

- Albania (Strasbourg, 2 March 2010)
  - Armenia (Strasbourg, 9 February 2011)
  - Austria (Strasbourg, 2 March 2010)
  - Azerbaijan (Strasbourg, 31 May 2011)
  - Belgium (Strasbourg, 26 May 2009)
  - Bosnia and Herzegovina (Strasbourg, 8 February 2011)
  - Bulgaria (Strasbourg, 24 February 2009)
  - Cyprus (Strasbourg, 31 May 2011)
  - Czech Republic (Strasbourg, 15 September 2009)
  - Estonia (Strasbourg, 2 March 2010)
  - France (Strasbourg, 15 June 2010)
  - Georgia (Strasbourg, 15 June 2010)
  - Germany (Strasbourg, 26 May 2009)
  - Greece (Strasbourg, 15 September 2009)
  - Hungary (Strasbourg, 24 February 2009)
  - Lithuania (Strasbourg, 13 September 2011)
  - Monaco (Strasbourg, 8 February 2011)
  - Norway (Strasbourg, 24 February 2009)
  - Poland (Strasbourg, 15 June 2010)
  - Serbia (Strasbourg, 31 May 2011)
  - Slovakia (Strasbourg, 26 May 2009)
  - Spain (Strasbourg, 8 February 2011)
  - Switzerland (Strasbourg, 15 September 2009)
  - “the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia (Strasbourg, 15 June 2010)
  - Turkey (Strasbourg, 8 February 2011)
  - United Kingdom (Strasbourg, 2 March 2010)
- 
- Proceedings of the Seminar “Combating racism while respecting freedom of expression” - 16-17 November 2006 (Strasbourg, July 2007)
  
  - “Ethnic” statistics and data protection in the Council of Europe countries, by Patrick Simon, *Institut National d’Etudes Démographiques* (Strasbourg, November 2007)
-

